



**Appendix E**  
MCA Table -  
Section 3: Sarsfield  
Road to City Centre

## Appendix E: Multi-Criteria Analysis – Section 3: Sarsfield Road to City Centre

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CCT10	Route Option CCT11	Route Option CCT12
Economy	Capital Cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Redistribution of road space on Sarsfield Road to remove contraflow bus lane and replace with westbound general traffic lane between junction with Woodfield Cottages and R833 Con Colbert Road. Removal of right-turn for general traffic from Sarsfield Road onto Grattan Crescent.</li> <li>• Redistribution of existing road space on R839 from junction with Sarsfield Road to junction with Emmet Road to provide bus lanes in both directions.</li> <li>• Redistribution of space on Emmet Road to provide bus lanes in both directions.</li> <li>• Install Bus Gate at Mount Brown. General traffic prohibited from travelling through Bus Gate.</li> <li>• Redistribute existing road space on R810 from Thomas Street to Christchurch to provide cycle tracks in both directions and bus lanes where possible.</li> <li>• Provision of cycle tracks on Con Colbert Road, R148 and Memorial Road as alternative for primary cycle route.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Redistribution of road space on Sarsfield Road to remove contraflow bus lane and replace with westbound general traffic lane between junction with Woodfield Cottages and R833 Con Colbert Road. Removal of right-turn for general traffic from Sarsfield Road onto Grattan Crescent.</li> <li>• Redistribution of existing road space on Grattan Crescent from junction with Sarsfield Road to junction with Emmet Road and removal of northbound general traffic lane to provide bus lanes in both directions. Carriageway profile is narrowed from existing.</li> <li>• Redistribution of space on Emmet Road to provide bus lanes in both directions where possible.</li> <li>• Install Bus Gate at Mount Brown. General traffic prohibited from travelling through Bus Gate.</li> <li>• Redistribute existing road space on R810 from Thomas Street to Christchurch to provide cycle tracks in both directions and bus lanes where possible.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Redistribution of road space on Sarsfield Road to remove contraflow bus lane and replace with westbound general traffic lane between junction with Woodfield Cottages and R833 Con Colbert Road. Removal of right-turn for general traffic from Sarsfield Road onto Grattan Crescent.</li> <li>• Redistribution of existing road space on Grattan Crescent from junction with Sarsfield Road to junction with Emmet Road and removal of the southbound general traffic lane to provide bus lanes in both directions. Carriageway profile is narrowed from existing.</li> <li>• Redistribution of space on Emmet Road to provide bus lanes in both directions where possible.</li> <li>• Install Bus Gate at Mount Brown. General traffic prohibited from travelling through Bus Gate.</li> <li>• Redistribute existing road space on R810 from Thomas Street to Christchurch to provide cycle tracks in both directions and bus lanes where possible.</li> </ul>

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CCT10	Route Option CCT11	Route Option CCT12
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Change in traffic management regime results in Memorial Road becoming two-way.</li> <li>Upgrade existing bus stops.</li> <li>Provision of new bus stops.</li> </ul> <p><b>Land Acquisition:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited land take required at the entrance to the new National Children's Hospital to facilitate the Bus Gate.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provision of cycle tracks on Con Colbert Road, R148 and Memorial Road as alternative for primary cycle route.</li> <li>Change in traffic management regime results in Memorial Road becoming two-way.</li> <li>Upgrade existing bus stops.</li> <li>Provision of new bus stops.</li> </ul> <p><b>Land Acquisition:</b></p> <p>Limited land take required at the entrance to the new National Children's Hospital to facilitate the Bus Gate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provision of cycle tracks on Con Colbert Road, R148 and Memorial Road as alternative for primary cycle route.</li> <li>Change in traffic management regime results in Memorial Road becoming two-way.</li> <li>Upgrade existing bus stops.</li> <li>Provision of new bus stops.</li> </ul> <p><b>Land Acquisition:</b></p> <p>Limited land take required at the entrance to the new National Children's Hospital to facilitate the Bus Gate.</p>
	<p><i>Rank</i></p>			
	<p>Transport Reliability and Quality of Service</p>	<p><b>Length of route:</b></p> <p>4.4km</p> <p><b>Priority:</b></p> <p>Full bus priority provided in both directions using bus lanes, Bus Gate and Signal Controlled Priority.</p> <p>Provision of Bus Gate on Mount Brown to ensure general traffic is removed except for local access. This would improve bus travel times and reliability along this section without the need for full bus lanes.</p>	<p><b>Length of route:</b></p> <p>4.4km</p> <p><b>Priority:</b></p> <p>Full bus priority provided in both directions using bus lanes, Bus Gate and Signal Controlled Priority.</p> <p>Provision of Bus Gate on Mount Brown to ensure general traffic is removed except for local access. This would improve bus travel times and reliability along this section without the need for full bus lanes.</p>	<p><b>Length of route:</b></p> <p>4.4km</p> <p><b>Priority:</b></p> <p>Full bus priority provided in both directions using bus lanes, Bus Gate and Signal Controlled Priority.</p> <p>Provision of Bus Gate on Mount Brown to ensure general traffic is removed except for local access. This would improve bus travel times and reliability along this section without the need for full bus lanes.</p>

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CCT10	Route Option CCT11	Route Option CCT12
	<i>Rank</i>			
Integration	Land Use Integration	<p>Most of area surrounding route is already substantially developed with little opportunity to encourage further.</p> <p>This route integrates well with the land use and objectives identified in the DCC Development Plan.</p>	<p>Most of area surrounding route is already substantially developed with little opportunity to encourage further.</p> <p>This route integrates well with the land use and objectives identified in the DCC Development Plan.</p>	<p>Most of area surrounding route is already substantially developed with little opportunity to encourage further.</p> <p>This route integrates well with the land use and objectives identified in the DCC Development Plan.</p>
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Residential, Employment and Educational Catchments	<p><b>Residential Population Catchment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 23,197 within 5-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 45,715 within 10-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 71,638 within 15-minute walk of route</li> </ul> <p><b>Employment Catchment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 17,280 within 5-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 37,618 within 10-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 68,089 within 15-minute walk of route</li> </ul> <p><b>Educational Catchment (1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, and 3<sup>rd</sup> Levels):</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2,685 within 5-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 10,393 within 10-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 31,690 within 15-minute walk of route</li> </ul>	<p><b>Residential Population Catchment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 23,197 within 5-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 45,715 within 10-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 71,638 within 15-minute walk of route</li> </ul> <p><b>Employment Catchment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 17,280 within 5-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 37,618 within 10-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 68,089 within 15-minute walk of route</li> </ul> <p><b>Educational Catchment (1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, and 3<sup>rd</sup> Levels):</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2,685 within 5-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 10,393 within 10-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 31,690 within 15-minute walk of route</li> </ul>	<p><b>Residential Population Catchment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 23,197 within 5-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 45,715 within 10-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 71,638 within 15-minute walk of route</li> </ul> <p><b>Employment Catchment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 17,280 within 5-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 37,618 within 10-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 68,089 within 15-minute walk of route</li> </ul> <p><b>Educational Catchment (1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, and 3<sup>rd</sup> Levels):</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2,685 within 5-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 10,393 within 10-minute walk of route</li> <li>• 31,690 within 15-minute walk of route</li> </ul>
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Transport Network Integration	<p>This route follows that of the main Dublin Bus services to Liffey Valley and Ballyfermot on Thomas Street only.</p>	<p>This route follows that of the main Dublin Bus services to Liffey Valley and Ballyfermot on Thomas Street only.</p>	<p>This route follows that of the main Dublin Bus services to Liffey Valley and Ballyfermot on Thomas Street only.</p>

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CCT10	Route Option CCT11	Route Option CCT12
		<p>This route serves the Luas Red Line directly at St. James's Hospital, where an interchange is possible.</p> <p>This route requires a Bus Gate at Mount Brown, effectively closing the road to general traffic except for access in the AM and PM peak. This would force traffic travelling towards the City Centre to reroute.</p> <p>This route option maintains the one-way system on Memorial Road between Chapelizod Bypass and R839 Inchicore Road.</p> <p>Access to St. James's Hospital and future National Children's Hospital would still be available in both directions.</p>	<p>This route serves the Luas Red Line directly at St. James's Hospital, where an interchange is possible.</p> <p>This route requires removal of northbound general traffic lane on Grattan Crescent, which will impact the flow of vehicles entering the City Centre.</p> <p>This route options provides for two-way access for general traffic between Chapelizod Bypass and R839 Inchicore Road via Memorial Road, permitting access to Grattan Crescent.</p> <p>This route requires a Bus Gate at Mount Brown, effectively closing the road to general traffic except for access in the AM and PM peak. This would force traffic travelling towards the City Centre to reroute.</p> <p>Access to St. James's Hospital and future National Children's Hospital would still be available in both directions.</p>	<p>This route serves the Luas Red Line directly at St. James's Hospital, where an interchange is possible.</p> <p>This route requires removal of southbound general traffic lane on Grattan Crescent, which will impact the flow of vehicles leaving the City Centre. The one way system on Grattan Crescent will also impact traffic travelling along Inchicore Road.</p> <p>This route requires a Bus Gate at Mount Brown, effectively closing the road to general traffic except for access in the AM and PM peak. This would force traffic travelling towards the City Centre to reroute.</p> <p>Access to St. James's Hospital and future National Children's Hospital would still be available in both directions.</p>
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Cycling Integration	<p>The majority of this route is designated as a primary cycle route (7A/7).</p> <p>It is not feasible to provide cycle tracks between Sarsfield Road and Bow Lane due</p>	<p>The majority of this route is designated as a primary cycle route (7A/7).</p> <p>It is not feasible to provide cycle tracks between Sarsfield Road and Bow Lane due</p>	<p>The majority of this route is designated as a primary cycle route (7A/7).</p> <p>It is not feasible to provide cycle tracks between Sarsfield Road and Bow Lane due</p>

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CCT10	Route Option CCT11	Route Option CCT12
		<p>to the limited spaces available between existing building lines.</p> <p>Cyclists have an alternative route to the City Centre via Sarsfield Road, Inchicore Road, Kilmainham Lane and Bow Lane where they will re-join the Proposed Scheme.</p> <p>It is proposed to provide continuous cycle tracks along James's Street and Thomas Street.</p>	<p>to the limited spaces available between existing building lines.</p> <p>Cyclists have an alternative route to the City Centre via Sarsfield Road, Inchicore Road, Kilmainham Lane and Bow Lane where they will re-join the Proposed Scheme.</p> <p>It is proposed to provide continuous cycle tracks along James's Street and Thomas Street.</p>	<p>to the limited spaces available between existing building lines.</p> <p>Cyclists have an alternative route to the City Centre via Sarsfield Road, Inchicore Road, Kilmainham Lane and Bow Lane where they will re-join the Proposed Scheme.</p> <p>It is proposed to provide continuous cycle tracks along James's Street and Thomas Street.</p>
	<i>Rank</i>			
Accessibility and Social Inclusion	Key Trip Attractors	<p><b>Education:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inchicore NS</li> <li>Mercy Secondary School</li> <li>Inchicore College of Further Education</li> <li>St. John of God School</li> <li>Canal Way Educate Together</li> <li>Various City Centre Schools</li> </ul> <p><b>Health:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>St. James's Hospital</li> <li>St. Patrick's University Hospital</li> </ul> <p><b>Retail / Leisure:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Irish Museum of Modern Art</li> <li>Kilmainham Gaol</li> <li>National Museum of Ireland</li> <li>Guinness Storehouse</li> <li>Christ Church Cathedral</li> </ul>	<p><b>Education:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inchicore NS</li> <li>Mercy Secondary School</li> <li>Inchicore College of Further Education</li> <li>St. John of God School</li> <li>Canal Way Educate Together</li> <li>Various City Centre Schools</li> </ul> <p><b>Health:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>St. James's Hospital</li> <li>St. Patrick's University Hospital</li> </ul> <p><b>Retail / Leisure:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Irish Museum of Modern Art</li> <li>Kilmainham Gaol</li> <li>National Museum of Ireland</li> <li>Guinness Storehouse</li> <li>Christ Church Cathedral</li> </ul>	<p><b>Education:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inchicore NS</li> <li>Mercy Secondary School</li> <li>Inchicore College of Further Education</li> <li>St. John of God School</li> <li>Canal Way Educate Together</li> <li>Various City Centre Schools</li> </ul> <p><b>Health:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>St. James's Hospital</li> <li>St. Patrick's University Hospital</li> </ul> <p><b>Retail / Leisure:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Irish Museum of Modern Art</li> <li>Kilmainham Gaol</li> <li>National Museum of Ireland</li> <li>Guinness Storehouse</li> <li>Christ Church Cathedral</li> </ul>

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CCT10	Route Option CCT11	Route Option CCT12
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>St. Patrick's Cathedral</li> <li>Smithfield</li> <li>Dame Street area</li> </ul> <p><b>Employment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Heuston South Quarter</li> <li>Dublin City Centre West</li> <li>Dublin City Centre South-West</li> <li>Saint James's Gate Brewery</li> <li>Inchicore Village</li> </ul> <p><b>Other:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Criminal Courts of Justice</li> <li>Four Courts</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>St. Patrick's Cathedral</li> <li>Smithfield</li> <li>Dame Street area</li> </ul> <p><b>Employment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Heuston South Quarter</li> <li>Dublin City Centre West</li> <li>Dublin City Centre South-West</li> <li>Saint James's Gate Brewery</li> <li>Inchicore Village</li> </ul> <p><b>Other:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Criminal Courts of Justice</li> <li>Four Courts</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>St. Patrick's Cathedral</li> <li>Smithfield</li> <li>Dame Street area</li> </ul> <p><b>Employment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Heuston South Quarter</li> <li>Dublin City Centre West</li> <li>Dublin City Centre South-West</li> <li>Saint James's Gate Brewery</li> <li>Inchicore Village</li> </ul> <p><b>Other:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Criminal Courts of Justice</li> <li>Four Courts</li> </ul>
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Deprived Geographic Areas	<p>The Dublin – South West Inner City, Dublin – South Inner City and Dublin – North West Inner City RAPID areas are within 10 minutes' walk of this route.</p> <p>There are 23 disadvantaged areas and 10 very disadvantaged areas, as shown on Pobal deprivation maps, within 10 minutes' walk of the route.</p>	<p>The Dublin – South West Inner City, Dublin – South Inner City and Dublin – North West Inner City RAPID areas are within 10 minutes' walk of this route.</p> <p>There are 23 disadvantaged areas and 10 very disadvantaged areas, as shown on Pobal deprivation maps, within 10 minutes' walk of the route.</p>	<p>The Dublin – South West Inner City, Dublin – South Inner City and Dublin – North West Inner City RAPID areas are within 10 minutes' walk of this route.</p> <p>There are 23 disadvantaged areas and 10 very disadvantaged areas, as shown on Pobal deprivation maps, within 10 minutes' walk of the route.</p>
	<i>Rank</i>			
Safety	Road Safety	<p><b>No. of junctions:</b> 10 signalised</p> <p><b>Vehicle Accident Data (since 2005):</b> 115+ minor</p>	<p><b>No. of junctions:</b> 10 signalised</p> <p><b>Vehicle Accident Data (since 2005):</b> 115+ minor</p>	<p><b>No. of junctions:</b> 10 signalised</p> <p><b>Vehicle Accident Data (since 2005):</b> 115+ minor</p>

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CCT10	Route Option CCT11	Route Option CCT12
		7 serious 1 fatal	7 serious 1 fatal	7 serious 1 fatal
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Pedestrian Safety	Footpaths are available on both sides for the majority of this route.  Pedestrian crossings located within 50m of 12 of 24 stops. <b><i>Pedestrian Accident Data (since 2005):</i></b>  49 minor 5 serious 1 fatal	Footpaths are available on both sides for the majority of this route.  Pedestrian crossings located within 50m of 12 of 24 stops. <b><i>Pedestrian Accident Data (since 2005):</i></b>  49 minor 5 serious 1 fatal	Footpaths are available on both sides for the majority of this route.  Pedestrian crossings located within 50m of 12 of 24 stops. <b><i>Pedestrian Accident Data (since 2005):</i></b>  49 minor 5 serious 1 fatal
	<i>Rank</i>			
Environment	Archaeology, Architectural and Cultural Heritage	There are 20+ recorded monuments / places, along this route, most of which are along Thomas Street.  64 protected structures are identified along the route, the vast majority of which are listed buildings along Thomas Street.  It is not intended to affect any of these protected structures or monuments.  The route passes through the architectural conservation area at Thomas Street but does not impact on this.	There are 20+ recorded monuments / places, along this route, most of which are along Thomas Street.  64 protected structures are identified along the route, the vast majority of which are listed buildings along Thomas Street.  It is not intended to affect any of these protected structures or monuments.  The route passes through the architectural conservation area at Thomas Street but does not impact on this.	There are 20+ recorded monuments / places, along this route, most of which are along Thomas Street.  64 protected structures are identified along the route, the vast majority of which are listed buildings along Thomas Street.  It is not intended to affect any of these protected structures or monuments.  The route passes through the architectural conservation area at Thomas Street but does not impact on this.
	<i>Rank</i>			

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CCT10	Route Option CCT11	Route Option CCT12
	Flora and Fauna	There is limited land take required along this route, and the route is generally within existing road reservations. As such, there would be minimal effect on flora and fauna.	There is limited land take required along this route, and the route is generally within existing road reservations. As such, there would be minimal effect on flora and fauna.	There is limited land take required along this route, and the route is generally within existing road reservations. As such, there would be minimal effect on flora and fauna.
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Soils and Geology	Given that the route is mostly contained within existing road reservations, there is minimal risk of any effects to the soils and geology in the area.	Given that the route is mostly contained within existing road reservations, there is minimal risk of any effects to the soils and geology in the area.	Given that the route is mostly contained within existing road reservations, there is minimal risk of any effects to the soils and geology in the area.
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Hydrology	A section of this route along the R810 is identified as being at risk from a 1 in 10-year flood event.	A section of this route along the R810 is identified as being at risk from a 1 in 10-year flood event.	A section of this route along the R810 is identified as being at risk from a 1 in 10-year flood event.
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Landscape and Visual	This route option makes use of existing road corridors along its length.  There is an impact to the landscape or visual amenity along R839 Grattan Crescent due to the removal of mature trees to facilitate a northbound bus lane.	This route makes use of existing road corridors along its length. There is little impact to the landscape or visual amenity.	This route makes use of existing road corridors along its length. There is little impact to the landscape or visual amenity.
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Air Quality	Widening is required along Grattan Crescent. The effects of this widening are minimal in terms of increases in air quality.	As the route is generally within the existing road reservations, it is unlikely to have much effect on air quality.	As the route is generally within the existing road reservations, it is unlikely to have much effect on air quality.
	<i>Rank</i>			

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CCT10	Route Option CCT11	Route Option CCT12
	Noise and Vibration	Widening is required along Grattan Crescent. The effects of this widening are minimal in terms of increases in noise and vibration.	This route is contained within the existing road reservation and no widening is proposed.	This route is contained within the existing road reservation and no widening is proposed.
	<i>Rank</i>			
	Land Use Character	<p>Grattan Crescent will be impacted by the removal of the existing mature trees to facilitate the proposed road widening.</p> <p>The majority of residential car parking spaces are retained along Emmet Road and R810, as these cannot be adequately relocated.</p> <p>Loading bays at shops along the route will be retained where possible.</p>	<p>Route option has little impact on existing land use, as it is generally contained within the existing road reservation.</p> <p>The majority of residential car parking spaces are retained along Emmet Road and R810, as these cannot be adequately relocated.</p> <p>Loading bays at shops along the route will be retained where possible.</p>	<p>Route option has little impact on existing land use, as it is generally contained within the existing road reservation.</p> <p>The majority of residential car parking spaces are retained along Emmet Road and R810, as these cannot be adequately relocated.</p> <p>Loading bays at shops along the route will be retained where possible.</p>
	<i>Rank</i>			